

PADSTOW PLANNING PROPOSAL

Economic Impact Assessment







Prepared for Bayswater Property Group



Contents

Execu	tive Su	ummary	/	5
1.0	Intro	oductio	n	7
	1.1	The sit	e	7
	1.2	The pla	anning proposal	
	1.3	Study	structure	
2.0	Com	petitiv	e review	10
	2.1	Strate	gic centres	10
		2.1.1	Bankstown strategic centre	10
	2.2	Local o	centres	10
		2.2.1	Padstow local centre	10
		2.2.2	Panania local centre	
		2.2.3	Revesby local centre	
		2.2.4	Riverwood local centre	
		2.2.5	Panania	12
3.0	Trad	le area	analysis	
	3.1	Trade	area identification	15
	3.2	Trade	area key socio-demographic characteristics	
	3.3	Trade	area population and workforce projections	
	3.4		nt retail expenditure	
4.0	Reta	il dema	and assessment	
	4.1		hold retail expenditure approach	
	4.1			20
	4.1	House	hold retail expenditure approach Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre	
	4.1	House 4.1.1	Retail capture rates by broad store type	20 20 21
	4.1	House 4.1.1 4.1.2	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre	20 20 21 21
	4.1	House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre Demand for retail floorspace	20 20 21 21 21 22
		House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4 Impact	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre Demand for retail floorspace Supply versus demand	20 20 21 21 21 22 22 23
5.0	4.2	House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4 Impact Planni	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre Demand for retail floorspace Supply versus demand ts on surrounding centres	20 20 21 21 22 22 23 24
5.0	4.2	House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4 Impact Planni	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre Demand for retail floorspace Supply versus demand ts on surrounding centres ng proposal implications	20 20 21 21 22 22 23 23 24 24 26
5.0	4.2 4.3 Ecor	House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4 Impact Planni	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre Demand for retail floorspace Supply versus demand ts on surrounding centres ng proposal implications mpact assessment	20 20 21 21 22 23 23 24 24 26
5.0	4.2 4.3 Ecor	House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4 Impact Planni Constr	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre Demand for retail floorspace Supply versus demand ts on surrounding centres ng proposal implications mpact assessment	20 20 21 21 22 23 23 24 24 26
5.0	4.2 4.3 Ecor	House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4 Impact Planni Constr 5.1.1	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre Demand for retail floorspace Supply versus demand ts on surrounding centres ng proposal implications mpact assessment Function economic impacts Estimated construction cost	20 20 21 21 22 23 23 24 24 26 26
5.0	4.2 4.3 Ecor	House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4 Impact Planni Constr 5.1.1 5.1.2	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre Demand for retail floorspace Supply versus demand ts on surrounding centres ng proposal implications mpact assessment Function economic impacts Estimated construction cost Construction multiplier effects	20 20 21 21 22 23 23 24 24 26 26 26 26 26 27
5.0	4.2 4.3 Ecor	House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4 Impact Planni Constr 5.1.1 5.1.2 5.1.3 5.1.4	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre Demand for retail floorspace Supply versus demand ts on surrounding centres ng proposal implications mpact assessment Function economic impacts Estimated construction cost Construction multiplier effects Construction related employment	20 20 21 21 22 23 23 24 24 26 26 26 26 27 28
5.0	4.2 4.3 Ecor 5.1	House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4 Impact Planni Constr 5.1.1 5.1.2 5.1.3 5.1.4	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre Demand for retail floorspace Supply versus demand ts on surrounding centres ng proposal implications mpact assessment Function economic impacts Estimated construction cost Construction multiplier effects Construction related employment Other construction impacts	
5.0	4.2 4.3 Ecor 5.1	House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4 Impact Planni Constr 5.1.1 5.1.2 5.1.3 5.1.4 Post-co	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre Demand for retail floorspace Supply versus demand ts on surrounding centres ng proposal implications mpact assessment Function economic impacts Estimated construction cost Construction multiplier effects Other construction impacts Other construction impacts	
5.0	4.2 4.3 Ecor 5.1	House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4 Impact Planni Constr 5.1.1 5.1.2 5.1.3 5.1.4 Post-co 5.2.1	Retail capture rates by broad store type Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre Demand for retail floorspace Supply versus demand ts on surrounding centres ng proposal implications mpact assessment construction economic impacts Estimated construction cost Construction multiplier effects Other construction impacts onstruction economic impacts Employment generation	
5.0	4.2 4.3 Ecor 5.1	House 4.1.1 4.1.2 4.1.3 4.1.4 Impact Planni Constr 5.1.1 5.1.2 5.1.3 5.1.4 Post-co 5.2.1 5.2.2	Retail capture rates by broad store type	



Apper	ndix A	: Foreca	ast retail expenditure	
6.0	Con	clusion.		35
	5.4	Net Co	ommunity Benefit Test	
		5.3.4	Street and laneway activation	
		5.3.3	Housing choice	
		5.3.2	Housing supply	
		5.3.1	Jobs closer to home	30
		5.3.2	Improved retail offer and increased competition	30
		5.3.1	Investment stimulus	30
	5.3	Other	economic impacts	30
		5.2.6	Impact on whole-of-government revenue	29

Tables

Table 1: Surrounding competitive centre floorspace summary	13
Table 2: Socio-demographic characteristics	17
Table 3: Population projections	17
Table 4: Main trade area (\$m)	18
Table 5: Padstow local centre aspirational target capture rates	20
Table 6: Total potential retail expenditure to Padstow (\$2018)	21
Table 7: Potential retail floor space demand (NLA)	22
Table 8: Retail Supply and Demand in Padstow by Store Type	23
Table 9: Estimated construction cost	26
Table 10: Construction multipliers (\$m)	27
Table 11: Construction employment	27
Table 12: Estimated employment generation	
Table 13: Estimated workers remuneration (\$2018)	28
Table 14: Estimated Industry Value Add of planning proposal (\$2018)	29
Table 15: Impact on whole-of-government revenue	30

Figures

Figure 1: The site	7
Figure 2: 1-17 Segers Avenue concept design	8
Figure 3: Surrounding competitive environment	13
Figure 4: Padstow trade area	16

Quality Assurance

Report Contacts

Nicholas Hill

Senior Consultant

B. Science, M Human Geography, Macquarie University (2012) M.A Property Development, University of Technology Sydney (2015)

Nick.Hill@hillpda.com

Supervisor

Adrian Hack *Principal, Urban and Retail Economics* M. Land Econ. B.Town Planning (Hons). MPIA <u>Adrian.Hack@hillpda.com</u>

Quality Control

This document is for discussion purposes only unless signed and dated by a Principal of HillPDA.

Reviewer			
Signature	DRAFT	Dated	06/03/19
Report Detail	s		
heport Detail	5		
Job Number	C19080		
Version	Final		
File Name	C19080 Padstow Planning Propos	al EIA_F	
Date Printed	6 March 2019		



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

HillPDA was commissioned by Bayswater Property Group to undertake an economic impact assessment (the study) for a planning proposal pertaining to land located at 1-17 Segers Avenue, Padstow (the site). The planning proposal seeks to rezone the site to permit mixed use development.

On completion the proposed development would comprise two separate six-storey mixed use buildings either side of the widened laneway connection. Combined the two buildings would provide 143 residential apartments and around 2,495sqm leasable commercial and retail floorspace.

Resulting from a lack of retail offering in Padstow, particular in supermarket and grocery space, there is a significant level of expenditure generated by Padstow residents that is directing to surrounding centres like Revesby. This leakage reduces expenditure that otherwise would be captured by retailers in Padstow, resulting in the current mundane level of trading in the Padstow centre.

The inclusion of retail space on the site would increase the retail offering and attractiveness of Padstow local centre to local residents and assist in reducing this leakage of expenditure.

Retail uses on the site, facing the laneway connection, would increase activation of both the laneway and the southern section of the Padstow local centre. This increased activation would benefit both local residents and businesses.

Direct economic impacts of the proposed development include:

- 1. Total economic activity generated by construction is estimated at \$200 million
- 2. Development under the planning proposal would provide 134 jobs years directly in construction on site
- 3. Due to production and consumption induced multipliers a further 396 job years would be generated.
- 4. Post construction, development would provide around 120 full time and part time jobs on site
- 5. The combined annual remuneration of those workers would be \$6.6 million (\$2017)
- 6. Gross value added (contribution to the local economy) would amount to around \$8.8 million per annum
- 7. Both residents and workers on site are likely to spend around \$2.7m each year on retail goods and services (\$2017) in the Padstow commercial centre
- Development would provide a net increase of 133 residential dwellings and 2,500sqm more commercial space within 200m of the train station making a significant contribution towards objectives of transit orientated development and transport sustainability
- 9. Revenue to whole of government would amount to \$25m which includes GST from the sale of new residential apartments, stamp duties, development contributions and payroll tax.





1.0 INTRODUCTION

HillPDA was commissioned by Bayswater Property Group to undertake an economic impact assessment (the study) for a planning proposal pertaining to land located at 1-17 Segers Avenue, Padstow (the site). The planning proposal seeks to rezone the site to permit mixed use development.

This study assesses the market potential for increased retail floorspace in this location and the likely trading impact this could have on the surrounding retail hierarchy considering likely growth in expenditure over time. The study also assesses the economic impacts of the proposed development.

1.1 The site

The site is located at 1-17 Segers Avenue in the suburb of Padstow within the local government area of Canterbury-Bankstown, around 3.5 kilometres from Bankstown strategic centre and 18 kilometres from Sydney CBD.

The 6,130sqm site currently contains a mix of one and two storey semi-detached and detached dwellings located adjacent to an existing high density residential area and Padstow local centre.

The site is located within 400 metres of Padstow railway station which forms the focal point for Padstow local centre which extends north, south and eastward from the station.

An existing laneway connection transects the site linking Padstow Public School the traditional town centre/train station.



Figure 1: The site



1.2 The planning proposal

The planning proposal seeks to amend the existing planning controls to facilitate the development of a mixed use building consisting of commercial, retail and residential uses.

Currently the site is zoned R2 - Low Density with a maximum building height of nine metres and floor space ratio of 0.5:1. The planning proposal aims to amend these planning controls to a B2 - Local Centre zone with a building height of 24 metres and a floor space ratio of 2.5:1.

On completion the proposed development would comprise two separate mixed use buildings either side of the laneway connection. The first development (1-5 Segers Avenue) would comprise a six storey building with 510sqm NSA of commercial/retail space and 47 residential apartments.

The second building (7-17 Segers Avenue) would comprise a six storey building with 1,985sqm NSA of commercial/retail space and 96 residential apartments.

Combined the proposed development would provide 143 residential dwellings and around 2,495sqm NSA of commercial and retail floorspace.

The proposal would also increase the width of the laneway connection providing a more desirable and activated streetscape outcome. This would create opportunities for a vibrant restaurant and hospitality offering, whilst also improving safety and security for the general public and in particular, school children.





Source: Concept design 1-17 Segers Avenue, Padstow - RHA

1.3 Study structure

To address the requirements of the brief, the study has been set out as follows:

Chapter 2 | reviews the surrounding retail hierarchy with particular focus on centres that could influence the provision of retail uses on the site and the extent of Padstow local centres trade area

Chapter 3 | identifies a trade area for Padstow local centre based on the retail composition of centre and surrounding hierarchy. The Chapter then provides an assessment of population and retail expenditure generated in this area

Chapter 4 | having forecasted the total amount of retail expenditure generated in the trade area, Chapter 4 quantities the amount and type of retail floorspace that could be accommodated in Padstow local centre

Chapter 5 | assesses the economic implications generated under the planning proposal.

COMPETITIVE REVIEW



2.0 COMPETITIVE REVIEW

The following undertakes a review of the surrounding retail hierarchy around the site. This includes a review of existing and planned centres of relevance that would influence a potential trade area and retail expenditure capture rates for various retail uses on the site.

2.1 Strategic centres

2.1.1 Bankstown strategic centre

Bankstown strategic centre is located approximately 5 kilometres or an 11 minute drive north of the site¹. Bankstown contains a comparatively large concentration of over 114,000sqm of retail floorspace and over 105,000sqm of commercial floorspace. The majority of retail floorspace is provided in Bankstown Central.

Bankstown Central is located directly south of Rickard Street and adjacent to Lady Cutler Avenue. The shopping centre provides 85,628sqm of retail floorspace and is anchored by a Myer, Big W, Kmart and Target, Woolworths and Super IGA. A further 275 speciality stores is also present in the centre².

In 2017 the shopping centre achieved a turnover of \$445.3 million equivalent to 6,102/sqm (based on the retail floorspace within the centre as estimated by SCN). This ranked the centre 69th nationally of the 96 similar sized centres recorded by SCN (of greater than 45,000) and \$836 or 12% below the median³.

Compass Centre Bankstown is a smaller shopping centre on the corner of Featherstone Street and North Terrace. The centre comprises a total retail floor area, it is understood that a development application has been submitted for redevelopment of the centre. Upon completion the redevelopment would include around 470 residential apartments and just over 7,000sqm of retail space.

Bankstown strategic centre has a cosmopolitan theme with a large range of different ethnic businesses. The diverse range of speciality food stores and take away shops provided in this centre include Lebanese, Chinese, Indian, Japanese, Pakistani, Indonesian, Vietnamese and Korean themed produce.

2.2 Local centres

2.2.1 Padstow local centre

Padstow local centre is centred at Padstow railway station. The centre is bounded by Watson Road to the north and Parker Lane to the south, with the railway line transecting the centre creating a northern and southern half with Cahors Road and a pedestrian bridge providing connectivity.

Padstow (North) contains community facilities such as a library, community park (Little Reserve), swimming pool and seniors living services. At the northern extreme of the centre are two mixed-use developments with retail, medical and commercial services on the bottom and two above ground levels of residential. The retail offer is primarily focused around a small strip of buildings located between Arab Road and the library. This retail offer is mainly top-up shopping with personal services and some fast food / restaurants with the buildings being of an older nature which contained a high level of vacancies in a 2014 survey undertaken by the former Bankstown Council.

¹ Google drive times, to Bankstown railway station

² NSW Shopping Centre Directory 2018

³ SCN Big Guns 2018



Padstow south of the railway line contains a larger quantum of retail floorspace and is anchored by a small Woolworths supermarket on Faraday Road (around 1,000sqm). Padstow Park Hotel, Padstow RSL Club and a large commuter carpark are key assets to this proportion providing impetus for further activation and stimulus. Retail offer consists of food outlets, restaurants, clothing and personal services with supportive commercial and medical services. Building form consists of two storey 1950 – 1960s buildings with a newer mix-use development located close to the station on Howard Road. Further residential developments within the commercial zoning are located along Howard Road consisting of low density, separate houses.

Floorspace surveys undertaken by the former Bankstown Council in 2014 indicated that the local centre contained approximately 33,000sqm of retail and commercial floorspace. Of this, 15,300sqm or 47% was attributed to retail uses, 16,000sqm or 48% was commercial and 1,570sqm or 5% was vacant.

The low vacancy rate of the centre at around 5% indicates at a reasonable preforming centre, whereas it was much higher in 2005 at 10.3%⁴. Notwithstanding it is believed that the centre is underperforming due to the lack of a large full-line supermarket.

Since the survey, redevelopment of the council car park increased retail floorspace in the centre by around 300sqm.

2.2.2 Panania local centre

Panania local centre is located approximately 3.4 kilometres or a 6 minute drive west of the site⁵. Panania is centred upon Panania station with the railway line transecting and separating the northern and southern proportions with the centre essentially is bounded by Marco Avenue in the north and Tower Street in the south.

Panania (North) contains a small quantum of retail and commercial land uses that predominantly face onto Anderson Avenue with Panania Hotel providing the role as the main anchor. Retail provision in the north consists of approximately twelve small commercial and specialty stores ranging anywhere in size from approximately 40sqm to 90sqm with an auto yard also further situated next to the Panania Hotel.

Panania (South) contains the majority of Panania's retail, commercial and community floorspace with stores facing Anderson venue and Tower Street. An IGA is located on Tower Street which is the anchor tenant. Community facilities within Panania (South) comprise a centrally located park and senior citizens centre, library and spiritual centre.

Floorspace surveys undertaken by the former Bankstown Council in 2014 indicated that the local centre contained approximately 15,555sqm of retail and commercial floorspace. Of this, 7,700sqm or 50% was attributed to retail uses, 6,850sqm or 44% was commercial and 965sqm or 6% was vacant.

The vacancy rate and the high proportion of non-retail uses suggest a mundane, or below average, performance within the centre. A considerable level of expenditure escapes the trade area to Revesby given the lack of a suitable anchor supermarket in Panania.

2.2.3 Revesby local centre

Revesby local centre is located approximately 1.8 kilometres or a 4 minute drive west of the site⁶. The centre is centred upon Revesby railway station and is bounded by Winders Lane to the north, The River Road to the east, Brett Street to the south and Tarro Avenue / Polo Street to the west. The railway line transects the centre creating a northern and southern section that is connected via a pedestrian bridge and The River Road.

⁴ AEC economics - Commercial Centres Study (2005)

⁵ Google drive times, to Panania railway station

⁶ Google drive times, to Revesby railway station



Revesby (North) contains the majority of retail floorspace in a range of retail uses which is anchored by a full line Woolworths Supermarket (4,000sqm). This northern side also contains the majority of the centres commercial activity and a large quantum of parking in both on street parking and designated parking facilities.

Revesby (South) currently contains a smaller quantum of floorspace which is concentred between Dixon Lane and The River Road. Lend lease recently developed Revesby Village which contains a Coles supermarket, Liquorland, six speciality shops and a small medical centre.

Revesby local centre has approximately 52,500sqm of retail and commercial floorspace (based on surveys undertaken by the former Bankstown Council in 2014). Of this, 21,600sqm or 41% was attributed to retail uses, 28,400sqm or 54% was commercial and 2,442sqm or 5% was vacant. With the development of Revesby Village retail floorspace is estimated at around 26,000sqm.

Revesby is one of the strongest performing centres in the LGA, if not the strongest in terms of retail turnover density (MAT/sqm). It's been a significant improvement since the earlier survey undertaken in 2005 the vacancy rate was much higher at 15.5%⁷.

2.2.4 Riverwood local centre

Riverwood local centre is located approximately 4.6 kilometres or an 8 minute drive east of the site⁸. Riverwood is centred upon Riverwood station with the railway line transecting and separating the northern and southern proportions with the centre essentially is bounded by Josephine Street in the north and Eldon Street in the south.

Riverwood (North) contains a quantum of retail and commercial land uses that predominantly face onto Belmore Road. Retail provision in the north consists primarily of convenience, food and personal service retailing.

Riverwood Plaza Shopping Centre is located in the southern proportion of the centre and provides around 7,825sqm of retail space. The shopping centre is anchored by a Woolworths and ALDI supermarket supported by 27 speciality retail shops.

Riverwood local centre is located in Riverwood Precinct where NSW DP&E is working closely with the City of Canterbury-Bankstown Council, Georges River Council and State agencies to plan for increased densities in the area. As such, the local centre is forecast to increase in size to support the surrounding population growth.

2.2.5 Panania

Panania is a Small Village centre at Panania Station is essentially bounded by Marco Avenue in the north and Tower Street in the south. North of the railway is a small quantum of retail and commercial land uses that predominantly face Anderson Avenue with Panania Hotel providing the role as the main anchor.

The majority of Panania's commercial space is south of the railway with stores facing Anderson venue and Tower Street. An IGA supermarket is located on Tower Street which is the anchor tenant. Community facilities in Panania comprise a centrally located park and senior citizens centre, library and spiritual centre.

The table and map below shows a summary of the centres and leasable retail floor space.

⁷ AEC economics - Commercial Centres Study (2005)

⁸ Google drive times, to Panania railway station



Table 1: Surrounding competitive centre floorspace summary

Centre	Retail floorspace	Major tenants
Bankstown	114,000	Myer, Big W, Kmart and Target, Woolworths and Super IGA
Revesby	26,000	Coles and Woolworths
Padstow	15,600	Woolworths
Riverwood	7,825	Woolworths and ALDI
Panania	7,700	IGA

Source: HillPDA, former Bankstown Council 2014 survey





Source: HillPDA

TRADE AREA ANALYSIS



3.0 TRADE AREA ANALYSIS

Given the site adjoins Padstow local centre, the proposed development would form part of the centre being a natural extension to the centre. This Chapter derives a trade area for Padstow local centre and subsequently estimates the amount of expenditure generated from residents to forecast demand for retail space.

3.1 Trade area identification

In defining a trade area served by the retail centre, we have considered the below:

- The strength and attraction of the centre, as determined by factors such as the composition, layout, ambience/atmosphere and car parking in the centre
- Competitive retail centres, particularly their proximity to the centre and respective sizes, retail offer and attraction
- The location and accessibility of the centre, including the available road and public transport network and travel times
- The presence or absence of physical barriers, such as rivers, railways, national parks and freeways.

The key attractors of Padstow comprise the rail station, commuter parking and a Woolworths supermarket of approximately 1,000sqm. Padstow attracts residents due to proximity and accessibility. However, a number of factors limit the extent of Padstow's trade area with the centre.

These factors include the absence of any large full-line supermarket coupled with a more limited convenience offer when compared to nearby centres, such as Revesby and Riverwood, and the presence of natural barriers such as the Georges River to the south.

Based on the surrounding retail environment, the composition of the centre, transport connections and presence of artificial/natural barriers, we have derived a main trade area for the site comprising two sub-trade areas. These are as follows:

- A primary trade area (PTA) this area predominantly comprises an area approximately bounded by the M5 Motorway to the north, Salt Pan Creek to the east, Henry Lawson Drive to the south and Gibson Avenue and Virginius Street to the west
- A secondary trade area-south (STAS) this area primarily extends southward from Henry Lawson Drive to Salt Pan Creek.

The trade areas are shown in the map below.



Figure 4: Padstow trade area



Source: HillPDA

3.2 Trade area key socio-demographic characteristics

Demand for retail floorspace is dependent not only on the number of households in the trade area but also the socio-demographic characteristics of those households. As such, we examined some key socio-economic characteristics of the main trade area, benchmarked against Canterbury-Bankstown LGA.

This analysis found:

- The age structure in the main trade area was skewed towards an older population, evident in the higher median age (+6 years) when compared to that recorded across the LGA
- Residents in the main trade area had higher household incomes (19% higher median) when compared to that recorded for the LGA
- Personal incomes were also higher in the main trade area (+24%) when compared to the wider LGA
- The average household size was reflective of that for the wider LGA
- The family composition of the trade area was comparable to that of the wider LGA
- Median residential rents in the trade area were \$58 per week higher than the LGA median.



Table 2: Socio-demographic characteristics

	Main trade area	Canterbury Bankstown LGA
Median Age	41	35
Household income	\$1,551	\$1,299
Personal income	\$622	\$501
Average person/dwelling	2.8	3.0
Couple family with no children	31%	27%
% Lone person Household	17%	18%
Median Weekly Rent	\$419	\$380
Sec. 486 Sec. 2016		

Source: ABS Census 2016

3.3 Trade area population and workforce projections

The following population projections were sourced from:

- The ABS 2016 Census
- Anysite 2017 population projections
- Forecast.id October 2017 population projections
- CordellsConnect development proposals.

The population in the main trade area is projected to increase from around 15,700 persons in 2016 to just over 18,710 by 2036. This represents 3,000 persons or 19% increase over its 2016 base.

The majority of this growth (85%) is expected in the PTA which is projected to increase by 2,553 residents or 20% over the period.

	2016	2017	2021	2026	2031	2036	Total growth
РТА	13,034	13,149	13,609	14,462*	14,977*	15,587*	2,553
STA	2,672	2,693	2,775	2,879	2,991	3,122	450
MTA	15,706	15,842	16,384	17,341	17,968	18,709	3,003

Table 3: Population projections

Source: HillPDA, Ansite 2017, Forecast id, ABS 2016 Census - *includes additional population from development (estimated at 310 residents)

3.4 Resident retail expenditure

This Section examines the projected growth in household retail expenditure in the main trade area between 2017 and 2036. Household expenditure was sourced from:

- ABS Household Expenditure Survey 2015-16 which provides household expenditure by broad commodity type by household income quintile
- AnySite data which is generated by combining and updating data from the Population Census and the ABS Household Expenditure Survey (HES) using microsimulation modelling techniques

AnySite combines the data from the Census, HES and other sources to derive total HES by commodity type.



The main trade area residents generated an estimated \$213 million in retail expenditure in 2017. This figure is forecast to increase to approximately \$292 million by 2036. This represents an increase of around \$80 million or 37% over the period.

Of total retail expenditure at 2017, approximately \$63 million, or about 30%, was spent in supermarkets and grocery stores. Expenditure in this retail sub-category is forecast to increase to around \$87 million by 2036.

For a detailed breakdown by the main trade areas sub-trade precincts, please refer to Appendix A.

Table 4: Main trade area (\$m)

Retail-sub category	2017	2021	2026	2031	2036
Supermarkets & Grocery Stores	63.2	67.5	74.4	80.2	86.9
Take-away Liquor Stores	6.1	6.5	7.2	7.8	8.4
Specialty Food Stores	7.5	8.0	8.8	9.5	10.3
Fast-Food Stores	12.3	13.2	14.5	15.6	16.9
Restaurants, Hotels and Clubs*	23.6	25.2	27.8	29.9	32.4
Department Stores	14.7	15.7	17.3	18.6	20.2
Apparel Stores	19.1	20.4	22.4	24.2	26.2
Bulky Goods Stores**	29.1	31.0	34.2	36.9	39.9
Other Personal & Household Goods Retailing	24.5	26.1	28.9	31.2	33.7
Selected Personal Services***	8.1	8.6	9.5	10.2	11.1
Total	212.7	227.1	250.2	269.8	292.3

* Turnover relating only to consumption of food and liquor (excludes all other types of revenue such as accommodation, gaming and gambling)

** Bulky Goods includes fabrics, soft goods, furniture, floor coverings, hardware, houseware, electrical appliances, sports and camping stores.

*** Selected Personal Services includes hair and beauty, laundry, clothing hire and alterations, shoe repair, optical dispensing, photo processing and hire of videos

RETAIL DEMAND ASSESSMENT



4.0 RETAIL DEMAND ASSESSMENT

Having forecasted the total amount of retail expenditure generated in the main trade area by the local resident population, this Chapter quantities the amount and type of retail floorspace that could be accommodated by Padstow local centre.

4.1 Household retail expenditure approach

4.1.1 Retail capture rates by broad store type

The previous analysis identified the total volume of retail expenditure in the main trade area. However, not all of this expenditure would be captured by Padstow local centre. Reasons for this include:

- The proximity of surrounding centres which provide a greater range and quantum of retail floorspace
- Residents leaving the locality to, predominantly, undertake discretionary shopping (in department stores, apparel stores and bulky goods stores elsewhere – such as Revesby and Bankstown)
- Working residents spending a portion of annual retail expenditure close to their place of work (approximately 15-25%)
- Expenditure from residents who are on holidays / business trips or are away for other reasons for any extended period.

The capture rates (ie the proportion of expenditure captured in the town centre) that have been adopted for the purpose of this report are aspirational rates. That is, the aspirational capture of expenditure by the local centre which appropriately provides for the weekly needs of its local trade catchment.

The current capture rates for the local centre are likely to be considerably lower, than that identified in the table below. This is because residents are likely travelling to Revesby and Riverwood local centres given their larger range of retail offering and presence of large supermarkets.

However, given Padstow is a local centre it is important to appropriately plan and provide for the retail needs of its catchment as such the below aspirational target capture rates were applied.

Table 5: Padstow local centre aspirational target capture rates

	РТА	STA
Supermarkets & Grocery Stores	75%	40%
Take-away Liquor Stores	75%	40%
Specialty Food Stores	65%	35%
Fast-Food Stores	65%	35%
Restaurants, Hotels and Clubs	15%	10%
Apparel Stores	10%	10%
Other Personal & Household Goods Retailing	20%	10%
Selected Personal Services	60%	30%

Source: HillPDA



4.1.2 Potential expenditure captured by a Padstow local centre

Based on these aspirational capture rates the local centre would have achieved total retail sales of around \$93 million in 2017, increasing to \$128 million by 2036. In reality total retail sales is likely to have been lower due to the retail mix, lack of strong supermarket anchor and the draw of shopping trips to Revesby and other centres.

With the right retail mix Padstow could potentially capture around 44% of total residential retail expenditure generated by main trade area residents. The balance 56% of expenditure would still be directed to the larger centres elsewhere.

YEAR	2017	2021	2026	2031	2036
Supermarkets & Grocery Stores	46.1	49.2	54.3	58.5	63.4
Take-away Liquor Stores	4.5	4.8	5.3	5.7	6.2
Specialty Food Stores	4.7	5.0	5.6	6.0	6.5
Fast-Food Stores	7.8	8.3	9.2	9.9	10.7
Restaurants, Hotels and Clubs*	13.7	14.6	16.1	17.4	18.8
Department Stores	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Apparel Stores	2.8	3.0	3.4	3.6	3.9
Bulky Goods Stores**	3.1	3.3	3.6	3.9	4.2
Other Personal & Household Goods Retailing	5.6	6.0	6.6	7.1	7.7
Selected Personal Services***	4.7	5.0	5.5	5.9	6.4
Total Retailing	92.9	99.2	109.5	118.1	127.9

Table 6: Total potential retail expenditure to Padstow (\$2018)

* Turnover relating only to consumption of food and liquor (excludes all other types of revenue such as accommodation, gaming and gambling)

** Bulky Goods includes fabrics, soft goods, furniture, floor coverings, hardware, houseware, electrical appliances, sports and camping stores.

*** Selected Personal Services includes hair and beauty, laundry, clothing hire and alterations, shoe repair, optical dispensing, photo processing and hire of videos

4.1.3 Demand for retail floorspace

In order to determine the demand or potential demand for retail floorspace within the town centre, target turnover rates (\$/sqm of retail floorspace, and otherwise known as Retail Turnover Densities (RTDs)) have been applied to potential retail sales from projected household expenditure. These RTD rates broadly represent industry benchmark averages.



YEAR	Target Rate*	2017	2021	2026	2031	2036
Supermarkets & Grocery Stores	11,000	4,187	4,401	4,760	5,030	5,341
Take-away Liquor Stores	11,000	407	428	463	489	519
Specialty Food Stores	7,500	629	661	715	755	802
Fast-Food Stores	7,500	1,039	1,092	1,182	1,249	1,326
Restaurants, Hotels and Clubs	5,000	2,736	2,876	3,111	3,287	3,491
Clothing Stores	6,000	474	499	539	570	605
Bulky Goods Stores	3,000	1,035	1,066	1,170	1,232	1,314
Other Personal & Household Goods Retailing	4,500	1,250	1,314	1,421	1,502	1,595
Selected Personal Services	3,500	1,338	1,406	1,521	1,608	1,707
Non-retail Services		1,455	1,443	1,561	1,649	1,856
Total Shop Front Space		14,550	15,186	16,443	17,371	18,556

Table 7: Potential retail floor space demand (NLA)

* Sources: ABS Retail Survey 1998-99 (2017 dollars), JHD Retail Averages, Shopping Centre News, Hill PDA and various consultancy studies An Allowance for Real Growth in Retail Store Turnover was made at 0.4% per annum.

Assumes 5% of trade is captured by shoppers beyond the trade area

By applying the above RTDs, the centre could support up to 16,700sqm of retail space by 2036. To achieve these retail sales however Padstow would need a large or full-line supermarket of at least 3,000sqm, possibly a second smaller supermarket, one or two mini-majors and a number of specialty shops (40-50 or more).

Typically a centre of this size would have additional demand from non-retail commercial businesses occupying shop front spaces. This includes financial, travel, medical and real estate services. An additional 11% or 1,850sqm could be expected for these businesses thereby increasing the potential size of the centre to around 18,500sqm.

4.1.4 Supply versus demand

Currently Padstow's total provision of retail floorspace is close to equilibrium with demand based on the above aspirational capture of household expenditure. However the centre is likely to be underperforming relative to other centres. In terms of retail turnover density centres like Revesby and Riverwood are significantly outperforming Padstow. This is because Padstow lacks a strong anchor retailer – a full line supermarket.

The supply and demand for retail space by retail store type is shown in the table immediately below.



YEAR	Demand*	Supply**	Over-supply	Demand in 2036
Supermarkets & Grocery Stores	4,187	2,125	-2,062	5,341
Specialty food and liquor	1,035	862	-173	1,321
Fast-Food Stores	1,039	1,221	182	1,326
Restaurants, Hotels and Clubs	2,736	3,663	927	3,491
Clothing Stores	474	1,042	568	605
Bulky Goods Stores	1,035	1,760	935	1,314
Other Personal & Household Goods	1,250	1,439	189	1,595
Services	2,711	3,201	490	3,563
Total Shop Front Space	14,257	15,313	1,056	18,556

Table 8: Retail Supply and Demand in Padstow by Store Type

* Based on assumed capture rates of household expenditure from Table 5

** Bankstown Council 2014 Land Use Survey

As shown in the above table Padstow is undersupplied with supermarket space but retail space in other categories is oversupplied – particularly in clothing, bulky goods and retail services. It's likely that these businesses are under performing.

Based on the above aspirational capture of household expenditure Padstow is forecast to have a total undersupply of retail floor space from 2022-23. Without further additions to floor space this undersupply is estimated to increase to around 3,200sqm by 2036 due to population and expenditure growth in the main trade area.

Presently, Padstow only has one supermarket larger than 500sqm being a Woolworths supermarket of around 1,000sqm. Applying the aspirational capture rates the centre could currently support around 4,200sqm of supermarket floorspace increasing to around 5,350sqm by 2036. This would be sufficient for the development of a full-line⁹ plus a smaller food store or mid-size supermarket¹⁰.

Resulting from the absence of a full-line supermarket a significant proportion of retail expenditure generated in the MTA is being directed to centres such as Revesby. The development of additional supermarket floorspace in Padstow therefore would reduce this leakage of expenditure helping the centre achieve its aspirational targets while also benefiting other retailers in the centre.

4.2 Impacts on surrounding centres

Our modelling suggests that if Padstow achieved its aspirational capture rates it would only absorb 44% of the retail expenditure generated in the MTA. 56% of expenditure would continue to leave the trade area being directed towards higher order centres including Revesby and Bankstown. This equates to around \$120 million escaping the trade area in current dollars but would increase to \$164 million by 2036.

As such, the proposed addition to retail floor space would not result in oversupply of shop front space in the centre. The impacts on the surrounding retail network would be minimal and would be absorbed quickly due to growth in population and expenditure in the locality.

⁹ Typically around 3,000sqm to 4,000sqm (Coles, Woolworths)

¹⁰ Typically around 1,000sqm to 1,800sqm (ALDI, Harris Farm, IGA, Evergreen Emporium, Coles or Woolworths Metro, etc)



4.3 Planning proposal implications

The planning proposal would provide around 2,500sqm of commercial/retail floorspace, of which around 1,800sqm will be ground floor retail fronting the widened pedestrian connection.

This retail floorspace could be a small format supermarket (1,000sqm to 1,200sqm) with supportive café and restaurant space (600sqm to 800sqm). Our demand modelling above indicates that the centre could support this additional floorspace without negatively impacting other retailers in the centre or nearby centres.

The lack of retail services, particularly grocery space in Padstow, is resulting in significant leakage of expenditure away from the centre to surrounding centres. An improvement in the retail offer would increase the attractiveness of Padstow reverse some of that leakage of expenditure to surrounding centres.

Additionally, retail floorspace fronting the laneway connection would increase activation of both the laneway and the southern section of the Padstow local centre. This increased activation would benefit both local residents and businesses.

ECONOMIC IMPACT ASSESSMENT



5.0 ECONOMIC IMPACT ASSESSMENT

This Chapter examines the economic impacts of the planning proposal during and post construction. Economic impacts include employment generation, wages and gross value added (GVA) (contribution to gross regional product), increased retail spend from local residents and workers, increased demand for retail floorspace and impacts on government revenue.

5.1 Construction economic impacts

5.1.1 Estimated construction cost

We have estimated the construction cost of the planning proposal at around \$62 million. This has been based on the following project elements.

Table 9: Estimated construction cost.

Component	No.	Units	\$/unit	\$m
Demolition and clearing	6,129	sqm	150	0.9
Residential apartments	143	apartments	300,000	42.9
Non-residential	2,850	sqm	2,200	6.3
Car Parking	199	spaces	50,000	10.0
Landscaping, site costs, external works, etc			800,000	0.8
Swimming pool*				1.2
TOTAL				62.0

Source: HillPDA, Rawlinsons Construction Handbook 2018 *based on the development of a 25 metres pool

5.1.2 Construction multiplier effects

The construction industry is a significant component of the economy accounting for 6.7% of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and employing almost one million workers across Australia¹¹. The industry has strong linkages with other sectors, so its impacts on the economy go further than the direct contribution of construction. Multipliers refer to the level of additional economic activity generated by a source industry.

There are two types of multipliers:

- Production induced: which is made up of:
 - first round effect: which is all outputs and employment required to produce the inputs for construction
 - an industrial support effect: which is the induced extra output and employment from all industries to support the production of the first round effect
- Consumption induced: which relates to the demand for additional goods and services due to increased spending by the wage and salary earners across all industries arising from employment.

The source of the multipliers adopted in this report is ABS Australian National Accounts: Input-Output Tables 2014-15 (ABS Pub: 5209.0). From these tables HillPDA identified first round effects, industrial support effects and consumption induced multiplier effects at rates of \$0.62, \$0.68 and \$0.93 respectively to every dollar of

¹¹ Source: IBIS World Construction Industry Report 2015



construction. The table below quantifies associated economic multipliers resulting from the construction process.

	Production Induced Effects		Consumption		
Effects		First Round Effects	Industrial Support Effects	Induced Effects	Total
Output multipliers	1	0.6260	0.6790	0.9340	3.2390
Output (\$million)	\$62.0	\$38.8	\$42.1	\$57.9	\$200.9

Table 10: Construction multipliers (\$m)

Source: HillPDA Estimate from ABS Australian National Accounts: Input-Output Tables 2015-16 (ABS Pub: 5209.0)

The estimated direct construction cost of \$62 million would generate a further \$81 million of activity in production induced effects and \$58 million in consumption induced effects. Total economic activity generated by construction of the proposal would exceed \$200 million.

Note that the multiplier effects are national, and not necessarily local. The ABS states that:

"Care is needed in interpreting multiplier effects; their theoretical basis produces estimates which somewhat overstate the actual impacts in terms of output and employment. Nevertheless, the estimates illustrate the high flow-on effects of construction activity to the rest of the economy. Clearly, through its multipliers, construction activity has a high impact on the economy."

In particular the multiplier impacts can leave the impression that resources would not have been used elsewhere in the economy had the development not proceeded. In reality many of these resources would have been employed elsewhere. Note that the NSW Treasury guidelines state:

"Direct or flow on jobs will not necessarily occur in the immediate vicinity of the project – they may be located in head office of the supplier or in a factory in another region or State that supplies the project"¹².

Despite these riders the construction industry provides considerable added value to the Australian economy.

5.1.3 Construction related employment

Every one million dollars of construction work undertaken generates 2.15 job years directly in construction¹³. Based on an estimated construction cost of \$62 million the proposal would directly generate 134 job years¹⁴ in construction.

Table 11: Construction employment

		Production In	duced Effects	Concumption	
	Direct Effects	First Round Effects	Industrial Support Effects	Consumption Induced Effects	Total
Multipliers	1	0.741	0.839	1.384	3.970
Employment No. per \$million*	2.154	1.597	1.808	2.981	8.540
Total job years created	134	99	112	185	530

Source: HillPDA Estimate using data from ABS Australian National Accounts: Input-Output Tables 2015-16 (ABS Pub: 5209.0)

¹² Source: Office of Financial Management Policy & Guidelines Paper: Policy & Guidelines: Guidelines for estimating employment supported by the actions, programs and policies of the NSE Government (TPP 09-7) NSW Treasury

¹³ Source: ABS Australian National Accounts: Input – Output Tables 2015-16 (ABS Pub: 5209.0) adjusted to 2018 dollars

¹⁴ Note: One job year equals one full-time job for one year



From the ABS Australian National Accounts: Input-Output Tables 2015-16 HillPDA identified employment multipliers for first round, industrial support and consumption induced effects of 0.74, 0.84 and 1.38 respectively for every job year in direct construction.

Including the multiplier impacts, the proposal would generate a total of 530 job years directly and indirectly.

5.1.4 Other construction impacts

The construction process may lead to short-term negative impacts in the locality such as increased traffic, noise, dust and so on. We have assumed that the development would take necessary steps to mitigate the extent of these impacts.

5.2 Post-construction economic impacts

5.2.1 Employment generation

Following construction, the planning proposal would provide employment floorspace, estimated at 1,800sqm NLA of retail space and 695sqm NLA of commercial space.

We have estimated that following construction and occupation the proposed development could accommodate around 120 jobs.

Table 12: Estimated	l employment generation
---------------------	-------------------------

Land use	Floorspace (NLA)	Sqm/employee	No. of workers
Retail general*	1,800	25	72
Commercial general	695	15	46
Total Employment	2,495		118

Source: HillPDA - *skewed towards food retailing - cafe/restaurant and small format supermarket

5.2.2 Salaries generation

Based on IBIS World Industry Reports, HillPDA has estimated a combined annual remuneration at approximately \$6.6 million for workers on site. The details by land use are provided in the table below.

Land use	No. of Workers	Average wage	Total wage generation (\$m)
Retail general	72	\$35,600	\$2.6
Commercial general	46	\$86,800	\$4.0
Total	118		\$6.6

Source: IBIS World Industry Reports, HillPDA

5.2.3 Gross value added

Gross value added (GVA) of an industry refers to the value of outputs less the costs of inputs. It measures the contribution that the industry makes to the country's wealth or gross domestic product (GDP).

Based on IBIS World Industry Reports, HillPDA has estimated the combined GVA from land uses proposed in the planning proposal at approximately \$8.8 million per annum. The details by land use are provided in the table below.



Table 14: Estimated Industry Value Add of planning proposal (\$2018)

Land use	No. of workers	GVA / worker	Gross Value Add (\$m)
Retail general*	72	\$46,230	\$3.3
Commercial general**	46	\$120,000	\$5.5
Total	118	•	\$8.8

Soure: Economy id - *food retailing **combinations of Financial and Insurance Services; Rental, Hiring and Real Estate Services; and Professional, Scientific and Technical Services

5.2.4 Expenditure from workers

HillPDA has applied a \$20 per day for non-residential workers within the development. As such, we have estimated an annual retail expenditure of \$542,800. This would be captured by retail services within and around the centre.

5.2.5 Expenditure from residents

The planning proposal would benefit the centre and its existing retailers by increasing the resident population and hence retail expenditure.

We have estimated that the site currently has a resident population of around 32 persons¹⁵.

HillPDA estimates that 342 residents would live on site based on an average occupancy of 2.52¹⁶ and a 5% vacancy rate.

As such, the planning proposal would increase the resident population in the MTA by around 310 residents.

Assuming completion and occupation by 2021 and an average spend of \$14,000¹⁷ total retail spend generated by residents on site would be around \$4.34 million (\$2018).

Of course not all of this expenditure will be captured by existing retailers in Padstow, but HillPDA would expect a rate of around 50% to 60% would be captured in the local area.

When combined with workers on site, the planning proposal would provide sources for an increase in retail sales captured by Padstow retailers likely in the order of \$2.6 million.

The resident population would also increase the demand for local retail services to be provided locally. It is estimated that the 310 additional residents would generate an additional demand for retail floorspace in the order of 744sqm¹⁸. A proportion of this would be directed towards Padstow and other centres within the LGA.

5.2.6 Impact on whole-of-government revenue

Based on the table below the planning proposal is likely to contribute an additional \$25 million to government revenue.

¹⁵ Based on 8 detached dwellings at 3.29 persons per dwelling and one town house at 3 persons per dwelling – 2016 Census Canterbury-Bankstown LGA

¹⁶ ABS 2016 Census Canterbury-Bankstown community profile – average number of persons in occupied apartments

¹⁷ Pitney Bowes Anysite 2017 Expenditure Data for PTA – assumed impact year of 2021 and real time growth of 0.8% per annum

¹⁸ Calculated at a per capita provision of 2.4sqm/person as identified within the draft North District Plan



Table 15: Impact on whole-of-government revenue

Source of Revenue	Total (\$m)
GST from Residential Apartments *1	9
Stamp Duty Revenue ^{*2}	11
Developer Contributions *3	1
Payroll Tax during Construction *4	1
Payroll Tax over 10yrs post construct *5	2
Land Tax Revenue (over 10yrs) ^{*6}	1
Total	25

*1 Assuming average apartment sale price of \$700,000

*2 Assuming average apartment sale price of \$700,000

*3 Section 94 (or 94A) + calculated at 1% of CC

*4 Assuming 50% of workers do not attract payroll tax due to varying business sizes

*5 Assuming 50% of workers do not attract payroll tax due to varying business sizes

*6 Assuming 20% of buyers are subject to land tax

5.3 Other economic impacts

5.3.1 Investment stimulus

Where a significant property investment decision has been made it is generally viewed as a strong positive commitment for the local area. Such an investment can in turn stimulate and attract further investment to the immediate area.

The planning proposal would create additional business opportunities in this locality associated with future residents. It would increase the profile of this area and in doing so increase the financial feasibility of future development, potentially acting as a catalyst on surrounding sites.

5.3.2 Improved retail offer and increased competition

The retail element of any new development on the site would be likely to attract new retailers to this part of Canterbury-Bankstown, providing an improved range of goods and services for local residents. Not only would the range of shops and services improve, increased competition between retailers is widely acknowledged as good for consumers.

Research on the topic suggests that inflated grocery prices are a result of the anti-competitive retail and urban planning environment and it has been argued that as a result of restrictive planning laws, consumers were paying up to 18% more for basic food items and up to 28% more for household products¹⁹. Redevelopment of the site to include some food retailing could go some way to addressing this issue for local residents through enhanced competition and service provision.

5.3.1 Jobs closer to home

There are many benefits associated with providing jobs closer to home, most notably a reduced need to travel and the knock on benefits associated with this in terms of reduced pressure on infrastructure.

A reduction in the number and length of journeys made, in particular those made in private vehicles, has environmental benefits. There are also lifestyle benefits related to increased free time, reduced travel related stress and a reduced likelihood of road related accidents.

¹⁹ ^[1] Professor Allan Fels, Dr Stephen Beare and Stephanie Szakiel, Choice Free Zone, Urban taskforce and Concept Economics



5.3.2 Housing supply

With a rapidly growing residential population, the supply of housing (and particularly of low cost housing) is under pressure. The impact of Sydney's well documented low housing supply and high market demand has been to drive the cost of housing upwards.

The proposed development would deliver 143 new residential apartments in the locality, creating additional housing supply in a highly sought after location.

The planning proposal will also contribute to housing supply by introducing another provider in the South Bankstown market. Multiple producers will ensure the market is not monopolised, encouraging greater competition and a healthy rate of supply.

The South District Plan has set a five year housing target of 13,250 additional dwellings to be completed in Canterbury-Bankstown LGA. This equates to an additional 2,650 dwellings per annum. The planning proposal would provide 143 new apartments (+133 dwellings) contributing to the LGA in meeting this target.

5.3.3 Housing choice

Providing a diverse range of housing options suiting a wide variety of household types, including apartment living will also promote a more diverse community which is arguably more sustainable in the long term, as they are able to maintain a range of services and facilities useful to all age groups. Apartments also offer a more affordable housing alternative to detached houses.

Furthermore the introduction of high density residential uses on a largely under-utilised site will also create activity after work hours and on weekends. This activity improves passive surveillance increasing the sense of security and also encourages local businesses to extend trading hours to capture the additional expenditure generated it the locality.

5.3.4 Street and laneway activation

The construction of a mixed use development comprising uses such as commercial, retail and residential located on the site would create increased pedestrian traffic having the effect of further activating the local area. This street and laneway activation would have the benefits of increasing security, increasing trade for retailers through increased passing trade and increase investment within the local area.

5.4 Net Community Benefit Test

Currently there is no statutory requirement for a net community benefit test (NCBT) to be undertaken as part of an EIA with exception that both the Greater Sydney Region Plan and the Central District Plan requires a net community benefit test to be carried out where a retail centre is proposed in an industrial area. Neither the regional nor the district plan defines what a NCBT is.

The earlier Draft Centres Policy prepared by NSW Department of Planning in 2009 referred to the NCBT as a measure of the sum of all benefits of a rezoning or development less the sum of all costs. Whilst this sounds like a cost benefit analysis the policy states that *"the assessment should only evaluate external costs and benefits (ie the externalities)"*. In other words only costs and benefits to third parties should be included and impacts on producers and consumers should be excluded.

The policy then lists a total of 14 criteria or questions in relation to proposed developments for retail uses. These relate to whether or not there is a net gain in employment, is it well served by public transport, would it result in reduction in use of private motor vehicle usage, would it improve competition and consumer choices, etc.



The Draft Centres Policy no longer has any statutory recognition and it was replaced in 2010 by the Draft Activity Centres Policy. This policy replaced the requirement for an NCBT with a "Sequential Test and Site Suitability Criteria". This tests whether there is a more suitable site (for example an appropriately zoned site in the centre) to meet projected demand. The Draft Activity Centres Policy was superseded by the regional and district plans.

Notwithstanding the above we have undertaken a simple NCBT which is summarised in the table below. The costs and benefits exclude producer and consumer impacts and summarises the externalities (impacts on third parties).

Impact	Mentioned in the former Draft Centres Policy?	Description of Impact	Benefit (+) / Cost (-)
Government tax revenue during construction	Not Directly	GST and stamp duty on end sales and payroll tax on construction	+ \$21m
Developer contributions	No	Developer contribution is an 'internalisation' of a social cost (ie the contributions are used to procure infrastructure/services to meet the needs generated by additional residents in the locality)	\$0
Proximity to Public Transport	Yes	Within 200m of Padstow rail station	+ (but not quantified)
Reduced private motor vehicle travel	Yes	Reduced congestion, greenhouse gas emissions, operating costs and improved transport safety	+ (but not quantified)
Improvement in Public Domain	Yes	Significant improvement by replacing the existing narrow laneway with a 12m wide active pedestrian courtyard. The benefit could be quantified using techniques such as 'use benefit' (number of people by time spent in the space) or opportunity cost of land (value of the land as a development site)	+ (but not quantified)
Increase choice and competition	Yes	Overall increase in retail floor space. While largely speculative it could be a food and grocery store (supermarket, discount foodstore or fresh food store) which is currently lacking in Padstow. This would improve price competition. Faced with competition there is some possibility of some existing retailers experiencing a decline in trade but overall trade in the centre would increase resulting from an increase in residents, workers and shops.	+ (but not quantified)
Multiplier impacts	Not Directly	Measuring multiplier impacts, both during construction and operations, is vexed and its limitations need to be recognised (see Section 5.1 above). Multiplier impacts from ABS input output tables are national whereas at a local level the impacts are considerably smaller. Nevertheless there would be some benefits to existing businesses in Padstow from construction workers during construction and from additional residents and workers post construction.	+ (but not quantified)



Overall there is a clear net benefit to third parties and to the overall local economy. There are no dis-benefits identified in the above table. Governments will benefit from an additional \$21m during construction and from the apartments sales. Improvement in the retail offer and increased price competition will benefit consumers. Increased density of housing and commercial uses within 200m of the train station contributes to transit orientated development and transport sustainability principles reducing travel, vehicle emission and accident costs. Improvement in the size and quality of the public domain area will benefit patrons with improved safety, amenity, beautification and useability.





6.0 CONCLUSION

The provision of a mixed use development on the site with commercial, retail and residential uses within 400 metres of Padstow railway station is reasonable while also meeting a demonstrated demand as established in this study.

With no net additional retail floorspace currently in the pipeline, Padstow local centre would experience an undersupply over the coming decade. The planning proposal would meet this future demand while avoiding negative impacts on surrounding centres.

Resulting from a lack of retail offering in Padstow, particular supermarket and grocery space, there is a significant level of expenditure generated by Padstow residents that is directing to surrounding centres like Revesby. This leakage reduces expenditure that otherwise would be captured by retailers in Padstow, resulting in mundane trading performance in the Padstow centre.

The inclusion of retail space on the site would increase the retail offering and attractiveness of Padstow local centre to local residents and assist in reducing the leakage of expenditure.

Retail uses on the site, facing the laneway connection, would increase activation of both the laneway and the southern section of the Padstow local centre. This increased activation would benefit both local residents and businesses.

Direct economic impacts of the proposed development include:

- Total economic activity generated by construction estimated at \$200 million
- The generation of 530 total job years directly and indirectly created during construction
- Post construction the development could accommodate around 120 jobs
- Combined annual remuneration at close to \$7 million for workers on site
- Around \$8.8 million per annum in GVA
- Total retail spend generated by residents on site would be around \$4.34 million
- Total retail spend generated by workers on site at around \$542,800
- Being within 200m of the train station it would contribute towards objectives of transit orientated development and transport sustainability
- Contribute an additional \$25 million to government revenue.

The planning proposal would increase the economic output of Padstow local centre and is supportable from an economic impact perspective.



APPENDIX A: FORECAST RETAIL EXPENDITURE

Primary Trade Area	2017	2021	2026	2031	2036
Supermarkets & Grocery Stores	53.0	56.7	62.7	67.5	73.2
Take-away Liquor Stores	5.2	5.5	6.1	6.6	7.1
Specialty Food Stores	6.3	6.7	7.4	8.0	8.6
Fast-Food Stores	10.4	11.1	12.2	13.2	14.3
Restaurants, Hotels and Clubs*	19.8	21.2	23.4	25.2	27.3
Department Stores	12.3	13.2	14.6	15.7	17.0
Apparel Stores	16.1	17.2	19.0	20.5	22.2
Bulky Goods Stores**	24.5	26.1	28.9	31.2	33.7
Other Personal & Household Goods Retailing	24.5	26.1	28.9	31.2	33.7
Selected Personal Services***	6.8	7.3	8.0	8.6	9.4
Total	178.8	191.0	211.3	227.7	246.6
econdary Trade Area					
Supermarkets & Grocery Stores	10.2	10.8	11.7	12.7	13.7
Take-away Liquor Stores	1.0	1.0	1.1	1.2	1.3
Specialty Food Stores	1.2	1.3	1.4	1.5	1.6
Fast-Food Stores	2.0	2.1	2.3	2.4	2.7
Restaurants, Hotels and Clubs*	3.8	4.0	4.3	4.7	5.1
Department Stores	2.3	2.5	2.7	2.9	3.2
Apparel Stores	3.0	3.2	3.4	3.7	4.0
Bulky Goods Stores**	4.6	4.9	5.3	5.7	6.2
Other Personal & Household Goods Retailing	4.6	4.9	5.3	5.7	6.2
Selected Personal Services***	1.3	1.4	1.5	1.6	1.7
Total	33.9	36.1	39.0	42.1	45.8
1ain Trade Area					
Supermarkets & Grocery Stores	63.2	67.5	74.4	80.2	86.9
Take-away Liquor Stores	6.1	6.5	7.2	7.8	8.4
Specialty Food Stores	7.5	8.0	8.8	9.5	10.3
Fast-Food Stores	12.3	13.2	14.5	15.6	16.9
Restaurants, Hotels and Clubs*	23.6	25.2	27.8	29.9	32.4
Department Stores	14.7	15.7	17.3	18.6	20.2
Apparel Stores	19.1	20.4	22.4	24.2	26.2
Bulky Goods Stores**	29.1	31.0	34.2	36.9	39.9
Other Personal & Household Goods Retailing	24.5	26.1	28.9	31.2	33.7
Selected Personal Services***	8.1	8.6	9.5	10.2	11.1
Total	212.7	227.1	250.2	269.8	292.3

* Turnover relating only to consumption of food and liquor (excludes all other types of revenue such as accommodation, gaming and gambling) ** Bulky Goods includes fabrics, soft goods, furniture, floor coverings, hardware, houseware, electrical appliances, sports and camping stores.*** Selected Personal Services includes hair and beauty, laundry, clothing hire and alterations, shoe repair, optical dispensing, photo processing and hire of videos



Disclaimer

- 1. This report is for the confidential use only of the party to whom it is addressed ("Client") for the specific purposes to which it refers and has been based on, and takes into account, the Client's specific instructions. It is not intended to be relied on by any third party who, subject to paragraph 3, must make their own enquiries in relation to the issues with which this report deals.
- 2. HillPDA makes no representations as to the appropriateness, accuracy or completeness of this report for the purpose of any party other than the Client ("Recipient"). HillPDA disclaims all liability to any Recipient for any loss, error or other consequence which may arise as a result of the Recipient acting, relying upon or using the whole or part of this report's contents.
- 3. This report must not be disclosed to any Recipient or reproduced in whole or in part, for any purpose not directly connected to the project for which HillPDA was engaged to prepare the report, without the prior written approval of HillPDA. In the event that a Recipient wishes to rely upon this report, the Recipient must inform HillPDA who may, in its sole discretion and on specified terms, provide its consent.
- 4. This report and its attached appendices are based on estimates, assumptions and information provided by the Client or sourced and referenced from external sources by HillPDA. While we endeavour to check these estimates, assumptions and information, no warranty is given in relation to their reliability, feasibility, accuracy or reasonableness. HillPDA presents these estimates and assumptions as a basis for the Client's interpretation and analysis. With respect to forecasts, HillPDA does not present them as results that will actually be achieved. HillPDA relies upon the interpretation of the Client to judge for itself the likelihood of whether these projections can be achieved or not.
- 5. Due care has been taken to prepare the attached financial models from available information at the time of writing, however no responsibility can be or is accepted for errors or inaccuracies that may have occurred either with the programming or the resultant financial projections and their assumptions.
- 6. This report does not constitute a valuation of any property or interest in property. In preparing this report HillPDA has relied upon information concerning the subject property and/or proposed development provided by the Client and HillPDA has not independently verified this information except where noted in this report.
- 7. In relation to any valuation which is undertaken for a Managed Investment Scheme (as defined by the Managed Investments Act 1998) or for any lender that is subject to the provisions of the Managed Investments Act, the following clause applies:

This valuation is prepared on the assumption that the lender or addressee as referred to in this valuation report (and no other) may rely on the valuation for mortgage finance purposes and the lender has complied with its own lending guidelines as well as prudent finance industry lending practices, and has considered all prudent aspects of credit risk for any potential borrower, including the borrower's ability to service and repay any mortgage loan. Further, the valuation is prepared on the assumption that the lender is providing mortgage financing at a conservative and prudent loan to value ratio.

8. HillPDA makes no representations or warranties of any kind, about the accuracy, reliability, completeness, suitability or fitness in relation to maps generated by HillPDA or contained within this report.

Liability limited by a scheme approved under the Professional Standards Legislation





SYDNEY

Level 3, 234 George Street Sydney NSW 2000 GPO Box 2748 Sydney NSW 2001 t: +61 2 9252 8777 f: +61 2 9252 6077 e: <u>sydney@hilpda.com</u>

MELBOURNE

Suite 114, 838 Collins Street Docklands VIC 3008 t: +61 3 9629 1842 f: +61 3 9629 6315 e: <u>melbourne@hillpda.com</u>

WWW.HILLPDA.COM